

## Reviews and Bibliographical Notes.

---

**The Insane in the United States and Canada.** By D. H. TUKE, M.D. London, Eng. H. K. Lewis, 1886.

The present volume being sketchy and desultory in style is exempt from very rigid criticism. From the author nothing but a well-written work was to be expected. Dr. Tuke opens very fittingly with a critical, just account of the career and labors of America's pioneer and greatest alienist, Rush, who, in many respects, was far in advance not only of his own period, but of the generation of alienists just now passing away.

Dr. Tuke's labors in Canada had decidedly good results. He unearthed abuses in the Longue-Point Insane Hospital, managed, under a contract, by the Sisters of Charity, who ran it in total defiance of the directions of the government inspector, Dr. Howard. That gentleman was unable even to secure the discharge of recovered patients. Money-patients were kept in restraint and dark seclusion to an extent equalled only in the United States county institutions. This is the second investigation of the kind, under the same control, in Canada, which has been shown to be badly managed.

In his sketch of the progress of provision for the insane in the United States Dr. Tuke fails to discern what a tremendous obstacle to progress the Kirkbride-Gray Clique of the American Insane-Hospital Superintendents' Association was. This clique virulently criticized Dr. Gray, one of its members, for having published, in a spirit of fairness, which he seems to have since lost, a paper of Dr. Galt, containing in essence the doctrines of insane-hospital architecture now becoming dominant; which shows how destitute of a scientific spirit, even in 1855, many insane-hospital superintendents were. Dr. Gray so profited by this lesson, that in 1878 he refused to publish in the *Journal of Insanity* a protest against extravagantly built insane-hospitals, by Dr. Isaac Ray. The work of the Insane-Hospital Superintendents' Association is the subject of too much eulogy. Dr. Tuke entirely ignores all defects of that body, even those which he criticised in the *Journal of Mental Science*.

He does not inform his readers that so late as 1875 paddling (more inhuman than whipping) was used in the Auburn, New York

State, Criminal Insane Hospital by the superintendent as a punishment, and that (New York Neurological Society, Answer, 1880) "at the very time when these abuses were committed at this institution, the American Association of Superintendents of Insane Asylums met at Auburn. They spent a half-day in inspecting its wards, and then passed resolutions which contained the following language: 'That their visit had been peculiarly interesting, as giving most obvious evidences of good management.'" Neither does he tell his readers that in the year 1882, nearly a century after the beginning of the labors of Pinel and Chiarruggi, chains were used in a Kentucky State insane hospital, and still are used in many county insane institutions in Illinois and elsewhere. He passes over in silence these and other facts with which he has been made acquainted through his connection with the *Journal of Mental Science*.

It is clear, therefore, that Dr. Tuke is not as free from bias as might have been expected. This is rendered still more obvious by a comparison of the present work with Bucknill's "Notes on Asylums in America," published in 1876. Bucknill was a good deal of a Boswell; like that prince of biographers he was, so far as his mental limitations allowed, true to history. In 1876, Bucknill finds the ruling majority of the Insane-Hospital Superintendents' Association arrogant, defiant of medical public opinion, and resenting as an insult the idea of governmental supervision of their labors. In 1884, Dr. Tuke finds a feeling in favor of governmental supervision so strong that the contrast requires explanation. Allowing for deceit, like that practised by Dr. J. P. Gray on Dr. Bucknill ("Notes on Asylums in America") in regard to restraint, on the one hand, and the increased and beneficial influence of Drs. Ray, Nichols, Godding, Gundry, Wallace, Hughes, Smith, Earle, Bryce, Macfarland, and others within the Association itself on the other, the change from 1876 to 1884 is not accounted for.

In 1878 the New York Neurological Society began the first organized medical movement for reform in psychiatry, and especially in insane-hospital management. To its labors are clearly due the change in the tone of the Association, the reforms in the study of psychiatry, and the improvements in insane-hospital management, now evident in American insane hospitals. How great the change so produced is, can be realized only by a comparison of the dogmatic views expressed to Dr. Bucknill in regard to restraint with the present status of American insane hospitals in this respect. In 1876 Dr. Bucknill was told that a vote of the Association had settled the question of restraint forever in the United States; in 1884 Dr. Carlos F. Macdonald was managing the Auburn Criminal Insane Hospital (the institution in which the paddle was regarded as necessary in 1875) without restraint. The movement of the New York Neurological Society, which rendered possible all reforms since Dr. Bucknill's visit, by diminishing the power medical politicians were able to wield

through their control of the Association, is passed over in complete silence by Dr. Tuke, although historical accuracy would require some notice of it in a volume like this. Dr. Tuke cannot plead ignorance, for he commended the paper which initiated this movement, in the following language (*Journal of Mental Science*, July, 1878): "Under the above title, Dr. Spitzka publishes an address to the New York Neurological Society, in the April, 1878, number of the JOURNAL OF MENTAL AND NERVOUS DISEASE, in which he criticises most severely, many people would say intemperately, the work of American asylum physicians, and the policy of the American Association of Asylum Superintendents. There is much truth, however, in what Dr. Spitzka says, and we think our American brethren will do well to take heed to this and many other indications that a more liberal and open mode of conducting their asylums and managing their Association is required. . . . For example, we have never sympathized with the exclusive and unscientific spirit which shuts out assistant medical officers of asylums from the privilege of membership. We hold it to be a mistake in policy, a misfortune in practice, and unjustifiable on any ground." It is difficult to understand why Dr. Tuke should have ignored that movement altogether; why he should not have commented on the contrasts between the conditions found by Dr. Bucknill as compared with those found by himself. The work, therefore, is lacking in information as to the history of provision for the insane in the United States.

Like Dr. Bucknill, Dr. Tuke has been led into commending the sham pathological work of Utica. The absurd results of the pathological labors of the Utica school are best judged by the following extracts from a paper by Dr. John P. Gray (*Amer. Jour. of Insanity*, Jan., 1878), based on the laboratory's microphotographs. He describes "granular bodies" (p. 10), "grumous granular matter" (p. 17), "encysted morbid products" (p. 21), "colloid bodies" (p. 23), "globules of a fatty nature" (p. 27), as being found in every form of insanity. These were shown by Spitzka (JOURNAL OF NERVOUS AND MENTAL DISEASE, 1878) to be artefacts due to the action of alcohol on nerve tissue. Dr. Savage has since corroborated Dr. Spitzka. Yet upon them was based the following conclusion: "A fact which seems of the utmost importance is the similarity of histological changes attending the different forms of insanity, as represented in the microphotographs, and indeed in all cases which have fallen under observation. If such regularity is displayed in future investigations, as I am strongly led to believe will be the case, this fact will practically confirm the principle, that in insanity we have to contend with *only one* DIATHESIS, manifesting itself under different phases in its progress and results."

Dr. Tuke should have remembered that not only Dr. Spitzka, but his own colleague, Dr. Savage, had demonstrated the uselessness of these Utica laboratory results. Nothing need be said had these been only useless, but they have been used to justify a

judicial murder. The findings in the case of Grappotte, executed for murder in obedience to the testimony of one of the Utica school, thus contrast with changes in the insane by Dr. Gray:

"THE INSANE.—Chain of granule cells with the residua of a disintegrated capillary. Cluster of granule cells, with residua of disintegrated capillaries.

"The gray cortical substance of the vascular system of the brain<sup>1</sup> [of Grappotte] revealed a fully normal supply of blood in all parts. Scattered through the tissues, however, especially at the base of the brain, there were many residua of degenerated and obliterated arterioles and capillaries. They represented small stems or shrubs with two, three, or more branches, lined by irregularly thickened hyaline walls of a fibrillous structure."

The present work of Dr. Tuke, so far as it relates to the insane in the United States, is decidedly faulty; it is more than just to the clique he criticised in 1878, and does not do justice to the labors of those who have nearly destroyed the autocratic power of that clique. The book is well issued.

J. G. K.

---

<sup>1</sup> So in original.